
Different Drummers: International Perspectives on Multicultural Education

Yuankun Yao

Dawna Lisa Buchanan

I. Joyce Chang

Ann Powell-Brown

University of Central Missouri

U. S. A.

Uzziel H. Pecina

University of Missouri-Kansas City

U. S. A.

This study compares social studies textbooks used in elementary schools of Canada, China, Mexico, Taiwan, and the U.S. in terms of how multicultural education is integrated into the curriculum. Based on Banks' framework of multicultural curriculum reform, the researchers examined the dimensions of content integration, knowledge construction, and prejudice reduction to assess the level of multicultural education represented in each textbook. The results were interpreted in the cultural, historical, and political contexts of each society.

Introduction

Method

Results

Discussion

References

If a man does not keep pace with his companions, perhaps it is because he hears a different drummer. Let him step to the music which he hears, however measured or however far away.

--Henry David Thoreau, *Walden*, 1854

Introduction

The drum of multicultural education can be heard around the world. Multicultural education posits that not every student can be taught in the same way because as individuals within our own societies we are not all the same (Banks & Banks, 2005; Gollnick & Chinn, 2009; Manning & Baruth, 2004). Our

personal experiences and cultures enrich and influence the way we interact with our peers, teachers, and societies. The goal of multicultural education is to provide all students (including those in the mainstream and in historically disadvantaged minority groups) with the necessary skills, attitudes, and perspectives to function in their communities and meet the challenges of the global and technological world (Banks, 2008; Gollnick & Chinn, 2009).

The successful attainment of such a goal depends to a large extent on the use and quality of curriculum materials. According to Sevier (2002), "Though classroom materials are not sufficient in and of themselves, they are necessary and powerful components of the multicultural classroom" (p. 119). Ideally, multicultural education, according to the Banks model, would be infused throughout educational content and experiences. However, multicultural content still tends to be addressed, in most schools, through the social studies curriculum. Social studies texts that provide an account of a historical or social event involving a particular group of people are often times imbedded with the views of the people who selected the passages. Both the content and the tone of the texts have the potential to impact the attitudes and perspectives of the students who read them. Due to the special role they play in multicultural education, social studies textbooks often become a subject of multicultural education research. For instance, Sevier (2002) examined a social studies textbook intended for use by students in Denver in the mid-20th century. The study shed much light on the early efforts in America to achieve social justice through multicultural education. Two recent studies by Camicia (2007, 2009) relied on social studies materials to examine the underlying perspectives related to immigration policy and civic and cultural choices in the current American society.

Banks' Framework of Multicultural Reform

As a prominent American scholar, James Banks (2004) proposed a widely adopted framework of multicultural curriculum reform that involves five dimensions: a) content integration, b) knowledge construction, c) prejudice reduction, d) equity pedagogy, and e) empowering school culture and social structure. The first dimension, content integration, refers to the use of examples and topics from different cultures and ethnic groups to illustrate concepts and theories in a subject area. Knowledge construction focuses on the way knowledge in various subject areas is created and how one's cultural assumptions, experiences, and perspectives influence the knowledge constructed. The dimension of prejudice reduction is to help students examine their preconceptions about other people, especially people in the minority group, and develop positive attitudes towards all human beings. Equitable pedagogy is achieved when a teacher is able to match teaching strategies with student learning styles to ensure the academic success of every student. The last

dimension requires that the culture and organization of a school be structured in such a way as to ensure equality and empowerment for students from all groups.

Building on the five dimensions, Banks (1994, 2006, 2008) proposed four levels at which multicultural education may be approached: a) contributions, b) additive, c) transformative, and d) social action. The contributions level features the use of lessons and activities that celebrate heroes, holidays, and special events of certain cultures. In spite of the inclusion of these topics, diverse views are not stressed in this approach. The additive level adds diversity to the curriculum by incorporating literature by or about people from diverse cultural groups to the mainstream curriculum. However, the incorporation of such views and content does not change or transform the basic curriculum, as the interpretations continue to reflect perspectives of the dominant group. In contrast, the transformative level changes the structure of the curriculum by encouraging students to adopt perspectives of minority groups. Finally, the social action level represents a step further by asking students not only to understand views and perspectives of others, but to take action to bring about social change.

Multicultural Education in Different Societies

As multicultural education spreads across the world, there is an increasing need for us to learn how multicultural issues are addressed in schools in different societies (Leeman & Reid, 2006). Unfortunately, such comparisons are not easy to make, due to the diversity in each society and different connotations attached to the concepts of multiculturalism and multicultural education. According to Eldering (1996), to analyze the nature of multiculturalism in a society, it is important to understand the way different ethnic groups coexist, the views on the identity of a society, the official policy about multiculturalism, and the way it is implemented in practice.

A review of the literature on multicultural education at the international level shows that the majority of studies focused on countries in the Western world, such as Australia, Britain, Canada, and the United States (e.g., Bonnet & Carrington, 1996; Fujikane, 2003; Gardner, Karakasoglus, & Luchtenberg, 2008; Gereluk & Race, 2007; Lopez, Freed, & Kijai, 2003; Phillion, 2002; Rhone, 2008). Consequently, as Bokhorst-Heng (2007) pointed out, the literature on comparative multicultural education has been dominated by a Western paradigm. Relatively few have examined multicultural educations in Asia and Latin America, where societies such as China, India, and Mexico have their unique ethnic make-ups, cultural histories, and political systems. Inclusion of such societies in multicultural education studies will not only help us understand the individual societies involved, but also broaden our perspectives on multicultural education in general. To provide a glimpse of multicultural education at the international level, this study compares how multicultural topics are presented in social studies textbooks from five societies in both the Western and Eastern hemispheres.

Method

The research team decided to focus on three of the five dimensions in Banks' framework of multicultural education: content integration, prejudice reduction, and knowledge construction. The goal was to determine the level of the multicultural education approach used in selected textbooks from each society. Due to the global reach of the study, it was not possible for the researchers to observe practicing teachers' pedagogy or student response to the social studies curricula in each of the selected societies.

The first dimension, content integration, was studied by examining the extent to which multicultural topics were introduced in each book. Multicultural topics in this study are defined as topics that pertain to the history, life style, and tradition of people different from the dominant group in a society, including the ethnic minority people and people from other countries. Knowledge construction was examined by looking at the use of authentic voices of the minority people and international perspectives in each text. Finally, prejudice reduction was judged based upon the underlying tones and stereotypes in a text, since exposure to such textual tones and stereotypes that represent particular views and perceptions of other people will impact the way children develop their own opinions and views. The information from this analysis provided the basis for understanding knowledge construction and prejudice reduction in the different texts. The results pertaining to the three dimensions were next used to determine the level of multicultural education represented in the textbooks of each society.

Textbook Selection

In order to compare multicultural education as reflected in the social studies curricula in the various societies, the researchers decided to focus on one or two social studies textbooks from each society where topics of domestic diversity and international perspectives were initially introduced to students. If topics in both areas were introduced in the same book, one book was selected. If the topics were introduced in separate books, two books were selected for that society. The main objective was to determine which textbook(s) introduced multicultural education for the first time.

The Canadian booklet *Many Voices* (2005) is specifically designed for the province of Alberta. The text has 80% of the market share in that province. The other booklet, *Around the World* (2001), is being used as a supplement across Canada. The Chinese textbook series, *社会* (Society) (2001), is used by all elementary schools in Jiangsu Province. The Mexican textbooks *Libro Integrado* (The Book of Fundamentals) (2004) and *Geografía* (Geography) (2005) are used by every elementary school as part of the national curriculum. The Taiwanese

series, *社會* (Society) (2004), is one of the most widely used in Taiwan. The U.S. text examined in this study, *People and Places* (2005), is one of the most popular texts for the first grade. Appendix 1 lists the textbooks selected and their grade levels. Tables of content for the books are provided in Appendix 2.

The researchers are education faculty currently teaching at two universities in the United States. Two were born in this country. One is Caucasian American, whose first language is English. The other is Mexican American, fluent in English and Spanish. The remaining three were born in Canada, Mainland China and Taiwan respectively. They were educated at the university level in their respective native land and are literate in, and speak, the official language in each society.

Multicultural Context of the Selected Societies

Each society featured in the study has a complex cultural and social history. A large percentage of Canada's people are descendents of British and French immigrants (Canada, 2007). Native inhabitants of the country are the First Nations people and the Inuit (aboriginal people living in northern Canada). The earliest immigrants were Europeans from France and Britain. Subsequent groups came from Western, Southern, and Eastern Europe, while more recent immigrants continue to arrive from Asia, Africa, and Latin America. The country has a history of formalizing policies to ensure its citizens' rights and freedom through legislation. The official aim of multicultural education is to ensure that there is a consensus of a "just" society and "unity within diversity" (Ghosh, 2004, p. 551) and "equality in education" (Gollnick & Chinn, 2009, p. 4). While change has taken place in the reduction of prejudice and inequality in Canadian society, critics suggest that progress has been slow. According to Nakhaie (2006), ethnic minorities are less likely to receive the income or employment normally matched with their educational training.

The Chinese government officially recognizes 56 ethnic groups. The dominant group, the Han Chinese, makes up about 92% of the total population (Li, 2005). The other 55 ethnic groups, such as the Mongolian, the Hui, and the Dai, are considered ethnic minorities. In recent years, more public attention has been given to valuing the diversity represented by this abundance of ethnicities (Northington & Paterson, 2002). Such efforts, however, have not been very successful in preventing the gradual decline of traditional minority cultures, since formal education is delivered in Mandarin Chinese, the language used by the educated Han Chinese and the quickest way to wealth and modern life in the country (Geary & Pan, 2003). Aside from the ethnic minority people who have been living in China for centuries, recent years have seen a small but increasing number of immigrants coming from overseas. Historically, China has considered itself the centre of the world and viewed the outside with disdain. Such a view was replaced by that of anger and mistrust toward the Western powers when the

latter forced its doors open towards the end of the nineteenth centuries. The economic reform started two decades ago, however, has gradually changed China's perceptions of the Western world. The country seems more open to becoming part of the international community.

The population in Mexico is also highly diverse. Two thirds of its people are Mestizos, Mexicans of mixed Spanish and indigenous ancestry. Over one-sixth are Amerindians, and nearly one-sixth are of European descent (Mexico, 2007). According to Brewster (2004), the Mexican government has been implementing a policy that values the country's diversity as well as its unity. Spanish has been mandated as the official common language for all Mexican nationals. At the same time, multicultural education was adopted in the curriculum, usually in social studies textbooks, to encourage respect for and promotion of indigenous cultures and languages (Secretaria de Education Publica, 2001). As with China, the push for modernization in recent years has put indigenous languages and cultures in Mexico at risk of becoming extinct (Paciotto, 2004).

The population of Taiwan consists of four major groups: the Fujianese and the Hakka (84%), the mainlanders (15%), and the aborigines (2%) (Liu & Kuo, 2007). Although the aborigines constitute a small percentage of the population, they inhabit about 31% of the land, mostly mountainous areas. The majority of the population in Taiwan descends from early Han Chinese settlers. In the second half of the 20th century, the dominant perspective in the society was that of the Han Chinese. In recent years, efforts to highlight the distinctive identity of the society have resulted in more attention to the native languages and cultures (Sandel, Chao, & Liang, 2006; Su, 2007). Today, multicultural education is used to enhance students' understanding of diverse cultures and international perspectives.

The United States is a diverse country made up of indigenous people and voluntary and involuntary migrants. According to Ford and Whiting (2007), about 43% of American public school students are culturally diverse today, compared to 22% in 1972. The country is a leader of multicultural education, owing largely to the 1954 decision in *Brown v. Board of Education* (Gay, 2004; Grant, 2004). The *Brown* decision "challenged citizens of the United States to take responsibility for eliminating divisions among themselves [and] to accept both their differences and similarities" (Gay, p. 195). Subsequent Civil Rights acts occurred in the 1970's for Native Americans and Mexican Americans. A glance at some of the basal readers developed in the 1970's reveals illustrations of children of color along with Caucasian classmates. Today, most content area textbooks include pictures of Americans of many ethnic backgrounds. Despite the many positive strides that have taken place, *de facto* segregation continues to exist in American society today. Multicultural education in American schools is also facing new challenges in recent years, as the No Child Left Behind Act has left teachers with less time to teach social studies (Banks & Banks, 2004).

Results

The analysis of the selected texts started with an examination of the grade levels at which multicultural education topics are first introduced. Depending on the length of the texts, one or two units of lessons were then selected from each textbook to compare multicultural education in the different societies in the dimensions of content integration, knowledge construction, and prejudice reduction. The following represents the results from this analysis.

Introducing Multicultural Education

In the Canadian, Mexican, and U.S. textbooks, multicultural topics are introduced in the early grades. One Canadian textbook for the second grade presents three domestic communities that are geographically and culturally diverse. The other second grade book introduces concepts of continents and countries around the world and invites students to explore topics such as climates, celebrations, clothing, food, cultural traditions, imports, and exports. Students in Mexico are introduced to domestic diversity in the first grade social studies textbook. Topics covered in the unit include Mexico's customs, festivals, languages, people, and vistas. Students in the fifth grade are introduced to other countries in the Americas. A unit of the first grade U.S. textbook discusses family celebrations that cover a plethora of ethnic and universal traditions. Table 1 lists examples of multicultural topics in the selected textbooks.

The Chinese and Taiwanese textbooks introduce multicultural education in the later years of elementary education, which is quite different from those in Canada, Mexico and the United States. In China, social studies coursework does not start until the fourth grade. Except for a brief introduction of traditions and festivals of various ethnic groups in one lesson in Book 2 (Grade 4, second semester), extensive coverage of multicultural topics is not found until the sixth grade. In the Taiwanese textbooks, although multicultural topics such as making friends with other people are occasionally encountered at the lower grade levels, they are not systematically covered until the 5th and 6th grades.

Although some textbooks cover multiple grade levels, the researchers focused on only one or two grade levels in each society when examining the application of Banks' framework. Two grade levels are targeted in China and Mexico because domestic diversity and internal perspectives are not introduced at the same grade level. Only one grade level is examined for Canada, Taiwan, and the U.S., because the domestic and international perspectives are introduced at the same grade level. Appendix 3 summarizes the specific lessons or units analyzed for this part of the study.

Table 1.

Examples of Diversity Topics in Social Studies Texts of Five Societies

	Ethnic Groups within Country	People from Other Countries
Canada	Daily life of the indigenous people: Igaluit, Meteghan, Saskatoon; cultures of the East Coast, the North, and the Prairies	Climates, celebrations, clothing, food, and traditions of Afghanistan, China, Holland, the Philippines, Somalia, Spain, and English and French speaking countries
China	Life and traditions of the Dai, Hui, Korean, Miao, Mongol, and Tibetan people	Geography, history, society, and life of people in Japan, southeast Asia, Russia, Western Europe, and U.S.
Mexico	Customs, festivals, and languages used in the country; the origin of the indigenous nation of Tenochtitlan	Ethnicity and cultures in other countries; immigration patterns and life in the Americas
Taiwan	Festivals, food, history, and traditions of aboriginals, i.e., mountain people; people newly arrived from Mainland China	Discussion of China, Holland, and Japan, as it pertains to the history of Taiwan
U. S.	Life styles and traditions of African, Caucasian, Chinese, Cuban, and Jewish American families	Life and celebrations in Kenya; types of homes in Chile, Greece, Hong Kong, and Morocco

Content Integration

The topics of diverse groups within each society are, in general, well integrated into the textbooks, except for those used in China. For instance, the first unit of the U.S. textbook for first grade introduces the concept of families with the acknowledgement that different families do different things on Saturdays. In contrast, the Chinese textbooks discuss diversity issues in special, stand-alone lessons. Book 1 of the Chinese textbook (Grade 4, first semester) starts with the unit on various aspects of family. Portrayal of family life reflects exclusively the traditions of the Han people. Family life in ethnic minority groups is discussed only in special units for those groups. Table 2 is a summary of the texts based on three dimensions of Banks' framework of multicultural education.

Table 2.

A Comparison of Social Studies Texts in Five Societies Using Banks' Framework

	Content Integration (Topics of domestic diversity and foreign countries)	Knowledge Construction (Authentic voice and international perspectives)	Prejudice Reduction (Attitudes towards and representation of other people)
Canada	Integrated in theme-based lessons	Regular use of authentic voices and international perspectives	Positive attitudes; idealistic representation
China	Only found in stand-alone lessons	Occasional use of authentic voices; regular use of international perspectives	Positive attitudes towards minorities; mixed attitudes toward foreigners; idealistic representation of minorities; mixed representation of foreigners
Mexico	Integrated in theme-based lessons	Little use of authentic voices; regular use of international perspectives	Positive attitudes; idealistic representation
Taiwan	Integrated in theme-based lessons	Little use of authentic voices; regular use of international perspectives	Positive attitudes; idealistic representation
U. S.	Integrated in theme-based lessons	Little use of authentic voices; regular use of international perspectives	Positive attitudes; idealistic representation

Foreign countries are covered in the textbooks in similar manners. Canadian, Mexican, Taiwanese, and U.S. texts organize discussion of foreign countries around themes. For example, the second grade Canadian booklet is divided into such units as "People around the World Speak Different Languages" and "People around the World Live in Different Climates." Each unit is focused on a general thematic topic such as language or climate rather than a separate country. The individual country introduced in each unit is only used to further illustrate the topic in the unit. The Chinese texts devote whole lessons to particular countries or subcontinents, with each lesson covering a wide range of topics for that country alone.

Knowledge Construction

Differences are also found across the texts in terms of knowledge construction (Table 2). One Canadian textbook makes frequent use of authentic voices when representing a culturally diverse society. Examples include three children introducing themselves: one indigenous child from Nunavut of northern Canada, one English-speaker Caucasian from the prairies, and a third French Canadian from eastern Canada. Quotes from the three characters are featured throughout the book under the heading "In My Own Words." In addition, three adults from each geographical area are interviewed and respond to questions in their own words, telling something special about their history and why they love where they are living.

The use of authentic voice is less obvious in the other texts. The perspective of Han Chinese, the dominant ethnic group in China, is the one "heard" in the section about the Dai people. The Mexican textbook represents the perspective of the dominant, middle class Mestizos. The Taiwanese text approaches history mainly from the perspective of the Han Chinese. In the first grade U.S. textbook, a famous minority person is occasionally quoted. Such direct quotes, however, represent a small portion of the book and do not adequately represent minority perspectives.

Despite the general absence of authentic voices for ethnic groups, the textbooks used in all five societies adopt an international perspective. For instance, the Chinese textbook Book 6 (Grade 6, 2nd semester) starts with the unit "Our World." The unit stresses the fact that we belong to the same world and that we need to understand each other. The last unit in the book, "Humans have only One Earth," continues this theme of international connection and globalization by stressing the need for world peace, human coexistence, and environmental protection. Similar perspectives are found in the textbooks from the other societies.

Prejudice Reduction

A generally positive tone is apparent in all the textbooks (Table 2). The authentic voice in the Canadian texts is suggestive of an appreciation for a cultural heritage that may be different from one's own. The Chinese text on the United States is positive when it suggests that the American people are usually self-reliant and prone to change. The Mexican first grade social studies book contains pictures that provide a positive portrait of national heroes and icons. In the Taiwanese textbook, a positive tone is used when referring to the diverse nature of the population. The tone used in the first grade U.S. textbook is also positive when presenting historical figures from various ethnic groups.

A less positive tone was noted in the Chinese lesson on the United States' history of expansions and invasions. Although the language is mild and discussion relatively brief, the text is reminiscent of China's traditional stance against Western imperialism. This stance may extend to the brief discussion of the historical treatment of Native and African Americans.

In all the textbooks selected, the representation of ethnic groups was incomplete. For instance, the portrait of the Dai people in a Chinese textbook seems somewhat idealistic. Although the description of the famous sceneries and unique traditions is truthful, the focus seems to conceal the fact that the area is still economically underdeveloped. A similar approach in the portrayal of ethnic minorities may also be found in texts from the other societies.

Discussion

The results of our study suggest that to different degrees, multicultural education topics are integrated in the selected textbooks in all five societies. Topics of ethnic groups and people from other countries are regularly covered in the texts, with the possible exception of the Chinese textbooks, where limited integration was identified (Table 1). In terms of knowledge construction, there is a general lack of authentic voices in the textbooks. The only texts in the study that featured authentic voices were from Canada. Nevertheless, each textbook emphasizes the globalization process and the interconnectedness of the world, which may help students understand people from different parts of the world. Finally, all textbooks in the study evidenced prejudice reduction through the use of positive tones in the description of ethnic minorities. However, the representation of some groups seems oversimplified to a degree that negates or ignores the complexity of their lives and cultures. This representation may be deliberately related to the young age of the students. It may also indicate a conscious attempt to compensate for former injustices.

The analysis of the textbooks based on Banks' three dimensions of multicultural education (Table 2) allows the researchers to speculate on the level of multicultural education approach in each society. The lack of content integration in the Chinese textbooks suggests that multicultural education is approached at a relatively low level. Nevertheless, a shift from its historical stance towards the West indicates that the Chinese approach may have begun to move beyond the additive level. No authentic voice is adopted in the Mexican texts, implying that the transformative level has not been reached. The Mexican books do succeed at integrating topics of cultural diversity into various units, which shows a level beyond the additive. Diversity issues in the U.S. textbook are fully incorporated into general social studies topics, yet the text lacks authentic voices in the portrait of ethnic groups. It should be noted that the conclusion is based on a textbook intended for first graders. In many US schools, social studies is initially introduced at the primary level in units developed by teachers, rather than through formal textbooks. By third grade, most school

districts appear to use formal social studies textbooks, which are written at a more sophisticated level than the first grade textbook used in this study. The Taiwanese textbooks have manifested a sufficient level of content integration. In addition, the texts reveal a new perspective on the history of the island and its relationship with the rest of the world. At the same time, the books largely reflect the perspective of the Han Chinese, suggesting that multicultural education as represented in the books has not reached the transformative approach. Of all the texts examined in the study, the Canadian texts provide the most convincing evidence of the transformative approach. In addition to a high level of content integration, the texts make extensive use of authentic voice to help the students develop alternative perspectives.

It is vital to remember that textbooks can only provide us with the content that *may* be used for multicultural education. As Center (2005) points out, readers of multiethnic texts may feel disoriented and uncomfortable with the encounter. Merely having good texts is not enough. Future research is needed to examine the pedagogical approach used in the actual implementation of multicultural education in each society. Such research would combine textbook analysis with a study of praxis of multicultural education, in which the remaining two dimensions of Banks' framework equity pedagogy and empowering school cultural and organization could then be considered.

In this study, Banks' framework of multicultural education reform provided a common framework for the research team to appreciate the beat of multicultural drummers around the world. At the same time, the team's assessment of the multicultural education levels represented in the texts relied on a reference to the cultural, historical, and political realities of each society. All drummers do not drum alike. As Arber (2005) suggested, a true understanding of multicultural education efforts in a society is not possible unless the unique context of that society is taken into full account. When socio-cultural context is examined along with the curriculum and praxis of multicultural education, our appreciation of diverse drummers at the international level will reach a new height.

References

- Arber, R. E. (2005). Speaking of race and identity: Exploring multicultural curricula. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 37(6), 633-652.
- Banks, J. A. (1994). Transforming the mainstream curriculum. *Educational Leadership*, 51(8), 4-8.
- Banks, J. A. (2004). Multicultural education: Historical development, dimensions, and practice. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Handbook of research on multicultural education* (2nd ed., pp. 3-29). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. (2005). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (5th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (2004). *Handbook of research on multicultural education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Banks, J. A. (2006). *Cultural diversity and education: Foundations, curriculum, and teaching* (5th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Banks, J. A. (2008). *An introduction to multicultural education* (4th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Bokhorst-Heng, W. (2007). Multiculturalism's narratives in Singapore and Canada: Exploring a model for comparative multiculturalism and multicultural education. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 39(6), 629-658.
- Bonnett, A., & Carrington, B. (1996). Constructions of anti-racist education in Britain and Canada. *Comparative Education*, 32(3), 271-288.
- Brewster, K. (2004). Redeeming the "Indian": Sport and ethnicity in post-revolutionary Mexico. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 38(3), 213-231.
- Camicia, S. P. (2007). Deliberating immigration policy: Locating instructional materials within global and multicultural perspectives. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 35(1), 96-111.
- Camicia, S. P. (2009). Identifying soft democratic education: Uncovering the range of civic and cultural choices in instructional materials. *Social Studies*, 100(3), 136-142.
- Center, C. (2005). "Desperately looking for meaning": Reading multiethnic texts. *MELUS*, 30(2), 225-241.
- Eldering, L. (1996). Multiculturalism and multicultural education in an international perspective. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 27(3), 315-330.
- Encyclopaedia Britannica (2007). *Canada*. Retrieved December 30, 2007, from <http://www.britannica.com/eb/article-43281>
- Encyclopaedia Britannica (2007). *Mexico*. Retrieved December 30, 2007, from <http://www.britannica.com/eb/article-27384>
- Ford, D. Y., & Whiting, G. W. (2007). Another perspective on cultural competence: Preparing students for an increasingly diverse society. *Gifted Child Today*, 30(2), 52-55.
- Fujikane, H. (2003). Approaches to international in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Japan. *International Review of Education*, 49(1/2), 133-152.
- Gardner, R., Karakasoğlus, Y., & Luchtenberg, S. (2008). Islamophobia in the media: A response from multicultural education. *Intercultural Education*, 19(2), 119-136.

- Gay, G. (2004). Beyond Brown: Promoting equality through multicultural education. *Journal of Curriculum & Supervision*, 19(3), 193-216.
- Geary, D. N., & Pan, Y. (2003). A bilingual pilot project among the Kam people in China. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 24(4), 274-289.
- Gereluk, D., & Race, R. (2007). Multicultural tensions in England, France, and Canada: Contrasting approaches and consequences. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 17(1-2), 113-129.
- Ghosh, R. (2004). Public education and multicultural policy in Canada: The special case of Quebec. *International Review of Education*, 50(5/6), 543-566.
- Gollnick, D. M., & Chinn, P. C. (2009). *Multicultural education in a pluralistic society* (8th ed). Columbus, OH: Merrill Pearson.
- Grant, C. A. (2004). Brown: Progress, challenges, and an argument for an inclusive race and ethnic framework of analysis. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 6(4), 18-21.
- Li, N. (2005). Speaking from otherness: A new perspective on diversity and educational equality. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 7(3), 36-41.
- Leeman, Y., & Reid, C. (2006). Multi/intercultural education in Australia and the Netherlands. *Journal of Comparative Education*, 36(1), 57-72.
- Liu, K., & Kuo, L. T. W. (2007). Cultivating aboriginal cultures and educating aboriginal children in Taiwan. *Childhood Education*, 83(5), 282-287.
- Lopez, A., Freed, S., & Kijai, J. (2003). Teaching strategies and adaptations of teachers in multiculturally diverse classrooms in Seventh-day Adventist k-8 schools in North America. *Journal of Research on Christian Education*, 12(1), 51-75.
- Manning, M., & Baruth, L. (2004). *Multicultural education of children and adolescents*. (4th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Nakhaie, M. R. (2006). Contemporary realities and future visions: Enhancing multiculturalism in Canada. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 38(1), 149-158.
- Northington, C., & Paterson, W. (2002). A snapshot of the changing face of education in the People's Republic of China. *Research for Educational Reform*, 7(1), 3-9.
- Paciotto, C. (2004). Language policy, indigenous languages and the village school: A study of bilingual education for the Tarahumara of Northern Mexico. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism*, 7(6), 529-548.
- Phillion, J. (2002). Narrative multiculturalism. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 34(3), 265-279.

- Rhone, L. (2008). Multicultural education policies in Canada and the United States. *Multicultural Review*, 17(4), 68-69.
- Sandel, T. L., Chao, W., & Liang, C. (2006). Language shift and language accommodation across family generations in Taiwan. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 27(2), 126-147.
- Secretaria de Education Publica (2001). Coordinacion nacional de carrera magisterial, primera edicion [Coordinating national career teachers, 1st ed.]. Mexico: Author.
- Sevier, B. R. (2002). The creation and content of an early "multicultural" textbook: Learning from "People of Denver". *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 30(1), 116-141.
- Su, Y. (2007). Ideological representations of Taiwan's history: An analysis of elementary social studies textbooks, 1978-1995. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 37(3), 205-237.

Appendices

1. Textbooks Analyzed in the Study

Canada

- Many voices: Communities in Canada: Looking at places* (2005). Toronto, Canada: Pearson Education.
- Tanz, A. (2001). *Ginn Social Studies 2: Around the World*. Toronto, Canada: Ginn.

China

- Sue Hui* [Society] (Vols. 1-6). (2001). Beijing, China: China Map Publishing.

Mexico

- Libro Integrado* (10^a reimpresión), *Primer grado* [The Book of Fundamentals, 10th ed., 1st Grade]. (2004). Mexico: Secretaria de educación publica.
- Geografia* (4^a reimpresion), *Quinto grado* [Geography, 4th ed., 5th Grade]. (2005). Mexico: Secretaria de educación publica.

Taiwan

- Sue Hui* [Society] (Vols. 5-8). (2004). Taiwan: Kang Hsuan.

U.S.

- People and Places* (2005). New York: Macmillan/McGraw-Hill Education.

2. Tables of Contents in Selected Textbooks

Canadian Book, 2nd Grade	
Ch. 1: People Live all over the World	
Ch. 2: People around the World Speak Different Languages	
Ch. 3: People around the World Live in Different Climates	
Ch. 4: People around the World Wear Different Kinds of Clothing	
Ch. 5: People around the World Eat Different Kinds of Food	
Ch. 6: People around the World Play and Celebrate in Different Ways	
Ch. 7: Things We Use Every Day Come from Places around the World	
Ch. 8: Look back	
Chinese Book, 6th Grade, 1st Semester	Chinese Book, 6th Grade, 2nd Semester
Unit 1: Our Country's Population, Resources, and Environments	Unit 1: Our World
Unit 2: People's Lives in Different Environments	Unit 2: Footprints of Human Civilizations
Unit 3: Famous Sites in China	Unit 3: Colourful World
	Unit 4: A Single World for the Human Being
Mexican Book, 1st Grade	Mexican Book, 5th Grade
Unit 1: The Children	Unit 1: The Universe and the Earth
Unit 2: The Family and the Home	Unit 2: Maps of the World
Unit 3: The School	Unit 3: The Earth's Crust
Unit 4: The Community	Unit 4: Our America
Unit 5: The Plants and the Animals	Unit 5: Those of Us that Live in America
Unit 6: The Country and the City	Unit 6: Mexico in the Americas
Unit 7: How We Measure Time/Days of the week	
Taiwanese Book, 5th Grade, 1st Semester	Taiwanese Book, 6th Grade, 2nd Semester
Unit 1: Natural Environment	Unit 1: Family, Society, and the World
Unit 2: Historical Review	Unit 2: Technology and Society
Unit 3: Think about Past	Unit 3: World as Family
U.S. Book, 1st Grade	
Unit 1: All about Families	
Unit 2: Where We Live	
Unit 3: Good Citizens	
Unit 4: All Kinds of Jobs	
Unit 5: Americans Long Ago	

3. Summary of Multicultural Units or Lessons Analyzed

<i>Country</i>	<i>Unit/Lesson Titles^a</i>	<i>Unit/Lesson Specification</i>	<i>Grade</i>	<i>#Pages</i>
Canada	Around the World	Whole booklet ^b (8 lessons)	2	17
	Looking at Places	Unit 1 (3 lessons)	2	48
China	The USA	Lesson 5 (Unit 3, Book 6)	6	9
	Xishuangbana	Lesson 5 (Unit 2, Book 5)	6	7
Mexico	Our Country	Unit 5 (11 lessons)	1	18
	Americas	Unit 5 (2 lessons)	5	24
Taiwan	Native Residents	Lesson 2 (Unit 2, Book 5a)	5	4
	Dutch	Lesson 3 (Unit 2, Book 5a)	5	4
	Han/Mainlanders	Lesson 4, 6 (Unit 2, Book 5a)	5	10
	Japanese	Lesson 5 (Unit 2, Book 5a)	5	4
U.S.	All about Families	Unit 1 (6 lessons)	1	56

^aSome of the titles given in the table may be abbreviations of the original unit or lesson titles.

^bThis Canadian textbook has 8 chapters. The whole booklet may be considered a single unit.