

## A Dialogue

Concession 1: No muscleman is a donkey.  
 $\exists x ( M(x) \wedge D(x) ) \rightarrow$  position untenable

Concession 2: Every spinach-eating person is a muscleman.  
 $\forall x ( SE(x) \rightarrow M(x) )$

Thesis: No spinach-eating person is a donkey  
 $\neg \exists x ( SE(x) \wedge D(x) )$

**Opponent:****Proponent:**

			0	$\neg \exists x ( SE(x) \wedge D(x) )$	
1	$\exists x ( SE(x) \wedge D(x) )$	Att-0	2	e,g.?	Q-1
3	$SE(p) \wedge D(p)$	Ans-2	4	2nd?	Q-3
5	$D(p)$	Ans-4	6	position untenable	D-1
7	why?	Att-6	8	1st?	Q-3
9	$SE(p)$	Ans-8	10	$\exists x ( M(x) \wedge D(x) )$	Q-Concession 1
11	e,g.?	Att-10	12	$M(p) \wedge D(p)$	D-11
13	1st?	Att-12	14	$M(p)$	D-13
15	why?	Att-14	16	$p ?$	Q-Concession 2
17	$SE(p) \rightarrow M(p)$	Ans-16	18	$(?)SE(p)$	Q-17
19	$M(p)$	Ans-18	20	you said so!	D-15